EXHIBIT D

(Filed Under Seal; Highlighting in Original)

To:

Cc:
RhahnAtTheOutCastAgencyCom[rhahn@theoutcastagency.com];

From:

Sent: Sun 4/8/2018 2:19:00 PM (UTC-08:00)

Subject: Re: A/C Priv - Re: Questions about Find Friends access removed from competitors for article today

R9 Redacted

On April 8, 2018 at 3:11:09 PM,   wrote:

for input on whether we've added anyone since Snow to the gatekeeper. Looks like Zalo, Tribe, and Yellow come after Snow but I'm not sure of the order)
I'm quite sure Google+ and YouTube have similar policies. Looking now.

Sent from my iPhone

On Apr 8, 2018, at 2:56 PM,   wrote:

+ ▮▮▮

R6 **Redacted**

▮▮▮▮▮▮ | Legal | Facebook, Inc.

▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮

From: ▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮
Date: Sunday, April 8, 2018 at 2:50 PM
To: ▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮
▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮
▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮
▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮
▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮
▮▮▮▮▮▮
Cc: RhahnAtTheOutCastAgencyCom <rhahn@theoutcastagency.com>, ▮▮▮
▮▮▮▮▮▮
Subject: RE: A/C Priv - Re: Questions about Find Friends access removed from competitors for article today

The only thing I'd add on top of Panjak's message is that Javi and Justin have described the rationale for this policy as avoiding user confusion. Specifically, our principle is that all messaging apps and apps with a feed based interface are not allowed to use this API to avoid user confusion. To date, we have only applied the limitation to messaging apps and apps that have a feed based interface – and even there for administrative reasons we have only restricted apps with significant volumes of users and/or a high growth rate.

From: ▓▓▓▓▓▓▓▓▓
Sent: Sunday, April 8, 2018 2:49 PM
To: ▓▓

Cc: RhahnAtTheOutCastAgencyCom <rhahn@theoutcastagency.com>; ▓▓▓▓▓▓▓▓▓
▓▓▓▓▓ ▓▓▓▓▓

Subject: A/C Priv - Re: Questions about Find Friends access removed from competitors for article today

A/C Priv

Adding ▓▓▓ and ▓▓ for institutional knowledge on how we've previously externally messaged the policy Josh/TC asks about below:

I'm working on a story to be published this evening about Facebook's history of removing Find Friends access from apps that replicate core functionality or don't share content back.

Can you provide a list of apps that have had this happen? I know of Twitter, Vine, Voxer, MessageMe, Wonder, Phhhoto (cut off by Instagram), and Path (cut off for spamming uploaded phone contacts). ▓ ==WE WON'T COMMENT HERE==

Does Facebook have a statement about why its policy states "You may not use Facebook Platform to promote, or to export user data to, a product or service that replicates a core Facebook product or service without our permission" (now listed as " Don't replicate core functionality that Facebook already provides." in the TOS)? How does Facebook respond to the criticism that if users want to share their friend list with another app and find their friends there, that Facebook blocking that is both anti-competitive and hurts users by reducing data portability? ▓ ==WHAT REASON AND/OR CRITERIA SHOULD WE CITE FOR WHY/HOW WE APPLY THIS POLICY?== *Here's what Justin said in the TC article in 2013: "For a much smaller number of apps that are using Facebook to either replicate our functionality or bootstrap their growth in a way that creates little value for people on Facebook, such as not providing users an easy way to share back to Facebook, we've had* policies *against this that we are further clarifying today (see I.10)."*

▓▓▓ – any thoughts here?

From: ▓▓▓ ▓▓▓▓▓▓▓▓▓
Date: Sunday, April 8, 2018 at 2:28 PM
To: ▓▓▓▓▓▓▓▓▓▓▓▓▓▓▓▓▓▓▓▓▓▓▓▓▓▓▓▓▓▓▓▓▓▓▓▓▓▓

Cc: Rebecca Hahn <rhahn@theoutcastagency.com>
Subject: Re: Questions about Find Friends access removed from competitors for article today

R5 Redacted

██/██ should chime in if I left out any context.

_____

██ ██████ | Legal | Facebook, Inc.
██ ██████ | ██████

From: ██████   ██████
Date: Sunday, April 8, 2018 at 2:16 PM
To: ████████████████████████████

Cc: RhahnAtTheOutCastAgencyCom <rhahn@theoutcastagency.com>
Subject: Re: Questions about Find Friends access removed from competitors for article today

Yes that's the easy q

From: [Redacted]
Date: Sunday, April 8, 2018 at 2:13 PM
To: [Redacted]

Cc: Rebecca Hahn <rhahn@theoutcastagency.com>
Subject: Re: Questions about Find Friends access removed from competitors for article today

R3 **Redacted**

Get Outlook for iOS

From: [Redacted]
Sent: Sunday, April 8, 2018 2:07:32 PM
To: [Redacted]
Cc: RhahnAtTheOutCastAgencyCom
Subject: Re: Questions about Find Friends access removed from competitors for article today

+ [Redacted]

R2 **Redacted**

R2 Redacted

██

──────────────

██ ████ | Legal | Facebook, Inc.

█ ██████ | ████████

From: █████ █████ ██████████
Date: Sunday, April 8, 2018 at 1:55 PM
To: ██
Cc: RhahnAtTheOutCastAgencyCom <rhahn@theoutcastagency.com>
Subject: Re: Questions about Find Friends access removed from competitors for article today

Hello All,

We have historically restricted Messaging apps from having access to the users_friends (including app friends). Pankaj/Alison have more authority to speak to this policy, but we have been keeping it broad enough to allow us to restrict apps that replicate core Facebook (most mostly Messenger functionality).

A few of the apps that have been in this list:

Twitter: 135811653099227, 2231777543

iTunes Ping: 146879158663523

Tweetdeck: 56212371378

Tellit: 358538967573629

YouTube: 87741124305

eBuddy: 2568656689, 127229817336080

Voxer: 108717019189000

TextPlus: 194671910604807

XMS: 137409049650615

MessageMe: 249820361808082

QQChat: 344134215672609

Band: 439691136064581

Line: 106149969545611

WeChat: 290293790992170

Snow: 654085398029607

Zalo: 198235073635027

Tribe: 1743579545897830

Yellow: 152071551534437, 478541172220486, 121523474607279, 163120830425401, 214976725587824, 381126551909069, 189446171109854, 420523694704108, 392431224194952, 353396508077924,

Also for completeness, a year or so ago, we had a debate about applying the same restrictions to apps like Musical.ly, Periscope, etc but we decided not to do so.

Best,

█

From: ██████ ███████
Date: Sunday, April 8, 2018 at 3:50 PM
To: ██

██

Cc: RhahnAtTheOutCastAgencyCom <rhahn@theoutcastagency.com>
Subject: Re: Questions about Find Friends access removed from competitors for article today

+█████ who has policy context

From: ███████ ████████
Date: Sunday, April 8, 2018 at 1:31 PM
To: ██

Cc: RhahnAtTheOutCastAgencyCom <rhahn@theoutcastagency.com>
Subject: Re: Questions about Find Friends access removed from competitors for article today

Hi all,

I'm looping in ████ and ████████ , who I believe have been closely involved with this policy.

@██ | **R1**   **Redacted** |

Get Outlook for iOS

From: ██ ████ ██████████
Sent: Sunday, April 8, 2018 1:12 PM
Subject: Re: Questions about Find Friends access removed from competitors for article today
To: ██

Cc: RhahnAtTheOutCastAgencyCom <rhahn@theoutcastagency.com>

+ ████ and ████

I don't know much about this – @███ ████ and@███ ████ , any insight you can provide here?

From: ████████ ████████
Date: Sunday, April 8, 2018 at 12:01 PM
To: ██████████████████████████████████ ████

RhahnAtTheOutCastAgencyCom
<rhahn@theoutcastagency.com>
Subject: Fwd: Questions about Find Friends access removed from competitors for article today

Who's the right person to handle this?

Begin forwarded message:

From: Josh Constine <joshc@techcrunch.com>
Date: April 8, 2018 at 11:53:38 AM PDT
To: ▊▊▊▊▊▊▊▊ ▊▊▊▊▊▊▊▊▊▊
Subject: Questions about Find Friends access removed from competitors for article today

Hello,

I'm working on a story to be published this evening about Facebook's history of removing Find Friends access from apps that replicate core functionality or don't share content back.

Can you provide a list of apps that have had this happen? I know of Twitter, Vine, Voxer, MessageMe, Wonder, Phhhoto (cut off by Instagram), and Path (cut off for spamming uploaded phone contacts).

Does Facebook have a statement about why its policy states "You may not use Facebook Platform to promote, or to export user data to, a product or service that replicates a core Facebook product or service without our permission" (now listed as " Don't replicate core functionality that Facebook already provides." in the TOS)? How does Facebook respond to the criticism that if users want to share their friend list with another app and find their friends there, that Facebook blocking that is both anti-competitive and hurts users by reducing data portability?

What is Facebook's explanation for not allowing the Download Your Information export of friends' email addresses that are visible to a user on those friends' profiles?

Thanks,

--

Josh Constine

Editor-At-Large, TechCrunch

(585)750-5674
http://www.twitter.com/JoshConstine
joshc@techcrunch.com